

Challenges of Artificial Intelligence for the Metaverse: A Scoping Review

KM Anwarul Islam^{1*}, Wahiduzzaman Khan², Md. Fakhrudoza Bari³,
Rehnuma Mostafa⁴, Fariah Anonhi⁵, Nurjahan Akter Monira¹

¹Department of Business Studies, School of Business and Social Sciences, State University of Bangladesh, ²School of Business, Ahsanullah University of Science and Technology, Dhaka, Bangladesh, ³Green Business School, Green University of Bangladesh, Dhaka, Bangladesh, ⁴Faculty of Business & Communication, Universiti Malaysia Perlis, Arau, Malaysia, ⁵School of Business and Economics, Universiti Putra Malaysia, Serdang, Selangor, Malaysia. *Corresponding Author's Email: anwarul.bs@sub.edu.bd

Abstract

The metaverse, a convergence of augmented reality (AR), virtual reality (VR), and blockchain technologies, represents an unprecedented digital frontier for immersive experiences, virtual interactions, and social connectivity. Artificial Intelligence (AI) is set to be pivotal in shaping the future of the metaverse, driving innovation in content creation, user interaction, and automation processes. This scoping review examines the multifaceted challenges associated with integrating AI into the metaverse, ranging from technical limitations, data privacy concerns, and ethical dilemmas to governance and security issues. The immersive nature of the metaverse introduces new complexities for AI, requiring real-time data processing, scalability, and robust ethical frameworks to address AI bias and transparency. Further complicating AI integration are privacy concerns, as the metaverse collects unprecedented volumes of personal data, requiring advanced security measures and user autonomy over data usage. The governance of AI in this global virtual space also poses regulatory challenges, as current frameworks are inadequate to address the complexities of the metaverse. This review identifies gaps in the literature and highlights areas for future research, advocating for interdisciplinary collaboration to tackle these obstacles. Finally, it is crucial to address these challenges for the successful and responsible integration of AI, ensuring that the metaverse develops ethically, inclusively, and safely for all users.

Keywords: AI Governance, Artificial Intelligence (AI), Augmented Reality (AR), Metaverse, Scoping Review, Virtual Reality (VR).

Introduction

The metaverse, an entirely immersive digital realm enabling user interaction via avatars in virtual settings, has garnered considerable attention in recent years. This digital ecosystem is expected to revolutionize various industries, including gaming, social media, education, and commerce (1). It serves as a persistent, real-time digital space where users, represented by avatars, can socialize, work, play, trade, and collaborate across diverse virtual worlds. Central to the functioning of the metaverse is Artificial Intelligence (AI), which is anticipated to enable dynamic user experiences, autonomous agents, and personalized content (2). Despite its potential, the integration of AI into the metaverse is fraught with challenges that need to be addressed to realize its full potential. Blockchain, artificial intelligence (AI), augmented reality (AR), and virtual reality (VR) are some of the technologies that have come together to form

the metaverse (3, 4). This unification promises to create a persistent, shared, 3D virtual space that ties the digital and real worlds (5). So, metaverse is envisioned as a hybrid of physical and digital realities, enabling new methods of communication, commerce, education, and entertainment, blurring the boundaries between the real and virtual worlds. As the boundaries between these realities blur, AI is poised to play a crucial role in shaping user experiences, managing vast amounts of data, and facilitating complex interactions within the metaverse (6). Likewise, the potential applications of AI in the metaverse are vast and varied. In gaming and entertainment, AI can create more realistic non-player characters (NPCs) and dynamically generate content, enhancing user engagement and immersion (7). In educational settings, AI-driven

This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution CC BY license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>), which permits unrestricted reuse, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

(Received 18th September 2024; Accepted 16th January 2025; Published 31st January 2025)

virtual tutors may be able to offer individualized instruction based on each student's needs (8, 9) e-commerce, AI algorithms could enable virtual try-ons and personalized shopping experiences, revolutionizing online retail (10). However, the integration of AI into the metaverse also raises significant challenges and concerns. Privacy and data security are paramount, as the immersive nature of the metaverse means that AI systems will have access to unprecedented amounts of personal data (11). Ethical considerations, such as the potential for AI bias and the blurring of lines between human and AI entities, must be carefully addressed (12). Technical challenges, including the need for real-time processing of vast amounts of data and the seamless integration of AI across diverse virtual environments, present significant hurdles (13). Furthermore, the governance of AI in the metaverse poses complex regulatory challenges. As the metaverse transcends traditional geographic boundaries, establishing cohesive regulatory frameworks that can keep pace with rapid technological advancements becomes crucial (14). The potential economic impact of AI in the metaverse, including its effects on virtual economies and labor markets, also warrants careful consideration (15). By providing a comprehensive overview of the challenges facing AI integration in the metaverse, this review aims to foster a deeper understanding of this complex landscape and encourage interdisciplinary collaboration to address these challenges. As the metaverse continues to evolve, it is crucial that we proactively engage with these issues to ensure that this new frontier of human-computer interaction develops in a manner that is ethical, inclusive, and beneficial to society as a whole. Hence, this scoping assessment attempts to outline the main obstacles facing AI in the metaverse, offering a thorough synopsis of the body of literature and pinpointing areas in which more investigation is required. This review aims to add to the continuing conversation on the ethical, technological, and legal ramifications of artificial intelligence in this developing digital environment by looking at the relationship between AI and the metaverse. Through a systematic analysis of current research, we aim to highlight critical gaps in knowledge and provide a foundation for future studies in this rapidly growing domain. The structure of this review is as follows: First, we outline our

methodology for conducting the scoping review. Next, we present our findings, categorized into key challenge areas, such as technical limitations, ethical concerns, privacy and security issues, governance challenges, and economic implications. We then discuss the implications of these findings and their relevance to various stakeholders, including researchers, policymakers, and industry practitioners. Finally, we conclude by summarizing the main challenges and proposing directions for future research in the field of AI and the metaverse.

Methodology

The scoping review adhered to the framework, which involves defining the research question, searching for relevant studies, selecting studies, organizing the data, and synthesizing the findings (16). The primary research question guiding this review was, "What are the key challenges associated with the integration of Artificial Intelligence in the metaverse?" This research question guided the review's focus, centering on identifying challenges at the convergence of AI and the metaverse. These challenges encompass technological limitations, ethical concerns, interoperability issues, and user experience problems. The study employed a thorough search strategy, utilizing various databases and resources to ensure a wide-ranging and pertinent collection of studies. Inclusion criteria were established to select research that addressed AI's function in virtual and augmented environments, as well as its impact on broader metaverse development. Following the selection of studies, data were methodically extracted and organized to facilitate a comprehensive thematic analysis. The synthesis uncovered significant obstacles, including issues related to data privacy, scalability, and the smooth integration of AI across diverse metaverse platforms. Finally, this review establishes a basis for comprehending the intricate challenges confronting AI integration within this embryonic digital realm, laying the groundwork for future research and technological progress.

Search Strategy

A comprehensive and systematic search of multiple academic databases was conducted to ensure the identification of relevant literature published between 2010 and 2023. This timeframe was selected because the earliest relevant studies

on this topic began to emerge in 2010. The databases included IEEE Xplore, ACM Digital Library, ScienceDirect, and Google Scholar, which were selected due to their extensive coverage of peer-reviewed journals, conference proceedings, and scholarly articles (17, 18). The search strategy employed a combination of keywords, Boolean operators, and filters to refine results and capture studies most pertinent to the current research topic (19). Hence, search terms and keywords used in the search included "artificial intelligence," "metaverse," "AI challenges," "ethics in AI," "data privacy," and "AI governance."

Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria

Inclusion criteria were set to identify studies that specifically discussed AI's role and challenges in the metaverse. Articles that focused on general AI applications without a direct link to the metaverse were excluded. Additionally, only peer-reviewed articles, book chapters, conference papers, and significant reports from credible organizations were included in this review.

Data Extraction and Analysis

The stated challenges guided the extraction and categorization of data from the chosen studies: technical limitations, ethical concerns, data privacy and security, and governance issues. The analysis focused on summarizing the key findings related to each category, recognizing common themes, and highlighting gaps in the existing literature (20).

Results

The current scoping review identified several critical challenges associated with AI in the metaverse, which are grouped into four main categories: technical limitations, ethical concerns, data privacy and security issues, and governance challenges.

Technical Limitations

The metaverse's requirement for real-time, scalable AI systems presents significant technical challenges. The AI systems powering the metaverse must process vast amount of data in real-time to provide seamless user experiences. Current AI technologies, particularly those based on deep learning, often struggle with scalability and real-time processing, leading to potential performance bottlenecks (21). Moreover, integrating AI with AR and VR technologies is complex, requiring advanced algorithms for real-time object recognition, natural language

processing, and user interaction (22). However, processing requirements for metaverse AI systems are predominantly demanding due to the multifaceted nature of user interactions. These systems must simultaneously handle spatial computing, gesture recognition, emotion detection, and environmental mapping while maintaining responsive feedback loops. Additionally, the distributed nature of metaverse environments necessitates sophisticated load balancing and edge computing solutions to manage computational resources effectively. Security and privacy considerations add another layer of complexity to AI system implementation. The real-time processing of sensitive user data, including biometric information and behavioral patterns, requires robust encryption and privacy-preserving computation methods. Furthermore, the scalability requirements of metaverse AI systems extend beyond traditional computational metrics. These systems must adapt to varying user loads, environmental complexities, and interaction patterns while maintaining consistent performance standards. The integration of machine learning models must account for continuous learning and adaptation without disrupting ongoing user experiences or requiring frequent system downtime.

So, addressing these technical challenges requires innovative approaches to AI system design and implementation. This includes developing more efficient algorithms and advanced hardware architectures, and implementing sophisticated caching and prediction mechanisms to reduce latency and improve scalability.

Ethical Concerns

Ethical considerations are paramount when deploying AI in the metaverse. Issues such as bias, fairness, and transparency are critical, as AI systems could inadvertently reinforce societal inequalities or manipulate users (23). The "black box" nature of many AI systems exacerbates these concerns, as users and developers may not fully understand how decisions are made (24). Furthermore, the metaverse's immersive nature could augment the ethical implications of AI, making it essential to establish robust ethical guidelines for AI development and deployment (25). Hence, to address the ethical challenges, organizations and developers need to establish robust frameworks for responsible AI deployment

in the metaverse. This includes implementing comprehensive bias testing protocols, developing transparent AI decision-making processes, and creating clear accountability mechanisms. Additionally, stakeholders must consider the establishment of ethical review boards, user advocacy groups, and regular impact assessments to ensure ongoing compliance with ethical strategies. Besides, the development of ethical AI in the metaverse also requires careful consideration of cultural differences and global perspectives. Ethical norms and expectations vary significantly across different cultural contexts, necessitating flexible and culturally sensitive approaches to AI governance. Organizations should work to create inclusive ethical frameworks that respect diverse cultural values while maintaining consistent standards for user protection and fairness.

Data Privacy and Security

The metaverse's reliance on AI-driven data collection and analysis raises significant privacy and security concerns. The collection of vast amounts of personal data, including biometric information from AR/VR devices, poses risks of data breaches and unauthorized access (26). Ensuring that users have control over their data and that AI systems are transparent about how data is used is crucial for maintaining trust in the metaverse (27). Additionally, the decentralized nature of the metaverse, often relying on blockchain technology (28), introduces unique security challenges that must be addressed to protect user data (29). While blockchain offers benefits for data integrity and verification, it also presents unique vulnerabilities. The interconnected nature of metaverse platforms creates potential security gaps at integration points between different systems and services. Furthermore, organizations face significant challenges in maintaining compliance with various data protection regulations while operating across different jurisdictions. The global nature of metaverse platforms requires careful attention to international privacy laws and standards. Hence, organizations must implement sophisticated privacy-preserving AI techniques, such as associated learning and differential privacy, to balance user protection with system functionality. Therefore, the protection of user data in the metaverse requires an inclusive approach that

combines robust technical solutions with clear policies and user education. Organizations should invest in advanced security infrastructure while developing transparent communication channels about data usage and protection measures. This cohesive approach helps build user trust while ensuring the secure and ethical operation of AI systems within metaverse environments.

Governance Challenges

A complicated task that calls for international cooperation and the creation of new legislative frameworks is the governance of AI in the metaverse. The global nature of the metaverse means that AI governance cannot be confined to national borders, necessitating harmonized international standards (30, 31). Additionally, the rapid pace of AI and metaverse development outstrips the current regulatory frameworks, leading to potential gaps in oversight (32). Industry self-regulation, coupled with governmental oversight, may offer a path forward, but this requires careful balance to avoid stifling innovation while protecting users (25). The implementation of effective governance mechanisms requires substantial investment in technical expertise. Regulatory bodies should develop refined monitoring capabilities to oversee AI systems in virtual environments effectively. This includes tools for algorithmic auditing, privacy protection assessment, and real-time compliance monitoring.

Discussion

The challenges identified in this scoping review highlight the complexity of integrating AI into the metaverse. And these multifaceted challenges necessitate a comprehensive approach to address technical, ethical, and governance issues. First, primary technical challenges, such as scalability and real-time processing, must be addressed through continued research and development. The metaverse's demand for seamless, high-fidelity experiences across a vast network of users presents unprecedented computational challenges. Edge computing and distributed AI systems offer promising solutions, potentially alleviating the burden on centralized servers and reducing latency (33). However, these approaches introduce new complexities in terms of data synchronization and consistency across the metaverse. Therefore, the development of more

efficient AI algorithms and hardware acceleration techniques is crucial. Quantum computing, while still in its infancy, holds the potential to revolutionize the processing capabilities required for complex AI operations in the metaverse (34). Research into neuromorphic computing, which mimics the architecture of the human brain, may also yield breakthroughs in energy-efficient AI processing suitable for metaverse applications (35). Second, ethical concerns, including bias and transparency, require the establishment of clear guidelines and best practices to ensure that AI systems are fair and accountable. The potential for AI to perpetuate or exacerbate existing societal biases within the metaverse is a significant concern. Researchers and developers must prioritize the development of bias detection and mitigation techniques specifically tailored to metaverse environments (36). However, transparency in AI decision-making processes is equally crucial, particularly in scenarios where AI agents interact with users or make decisions that impact user experiences. Explainable AI (XAI) techniques need to be adapted and refined for the metaverse context, allowing users to understand and trust the AI systems they interact with (37). Furthermore, the development of ethical frameworks that address the unique challenges of AI in immersive, persistent virtual environments is essential. These frameworks should consider issues such as AI-driven behavior manipulation, the blurring of lines between human and AI entities, and the potential psychological impacts of prolonged interaction with AI in the metaverse. Third, data privacy and security remain critical issues, particularly given the sensitive nature of the data collected in the metaverse. The immersive nature of the metaverse means that AI systems will have access to unprecedented amounts of user data, including biometric information, social interactions, and even cognitive patterns. Robust encryption methods and secure data storage solutions are essential, but they must be balanced with the need for real-time data processing to maintain the metaverse's responsiveness (38). Consequently, the implementation of privacy-preserving AI techniques, such as federated learning and differential privacy, offers promising avenues for protecting user data while still allowing for powerful AI capabilities (35). Additionally, the development of user-centric data

control mechanisms is crucial, empowering individuals to manage their digital footprint within the metaverse effectively. Fourth, the development of governance frameworks that can keep pace with technological advancements is essential to ensure that the metaverse evolves in a safe, ethical, and inclusive manner. Traditional regulatory approaches may struggle to address the rapid and often unpredictable developments in AI and metaverse technologies. Adaptive governance models that can quickly respond to emerging challenges and opportunities are needed (39). Hence, international cooperation will be crucial in developing standardized protocols and interoperability standards for AI in the metaverse. This collaboration should involve not only governments and tech companies but also ethicists, social scientists, and representatives from diverse user communities to ensure a comprehensive approach to governance (40). Fifth, the integration of AI in the metaverse raises important questions about the nature of social interactions and cultural expression in virtual spaces. AI-driven avatars and environments have the potential to both enrich and complicate human relationships and cultural exchanges. Research into the psychological and sociological impacts of sustained interaction with AI entities in enticing environments is critical (41). Furthermore, the potential for AI to facilitate cross-cultural understanding through real-time language translation and cultural contextualization in the metaverse is an exciting prospect that warrants further exploration. However, care must be taken to avoid cultural homogenization and to preserve the diversity of human expression in these virtual spaces (42). Sixth, the success of metaverse governance largely depends on effective collaboration between technical experts and policymakers. This partnership requires well-thought-out approaches to knowledge sharing, clear communication channels, and ongoing commitment to maintaining current understanding of technological developments. As the metaverse continues to advance, investing in strong relationships between these key stakeholders groups remains crucial for addressing current and future challenges in this dynamic ecosystem. This collaborative approach ensures that regulatory frameworks remain both technically feasible and effectively protective of

user interests while promoting responsible innovation in the metaverse environment. Regular evaluation and adjustment of these collaborative efforts helps maintain their effectiveness as technology and policy needs evolve. Finally, the economic implications of AI integration in the metaverse are far-reaching. While AI has the potential to create new economic opportunities and business models within the metaverse, it also raises concerns about job displacement and economic inequality. The development of AI-driven virtual economies requires careful consideration of issues, such as digital currency regulation, virtual property rights, and fair competition policies (43). Moreover, the potential for AI to generate and manipulate virtual assets and experiences raises questions about intellectual property rights and the valuation of AI-created content. Developing equitable systems for recognizing and rewarding human creativity in collaboration with AI will be crucial for fostering a flourishing creative economy in the metaverse.

Future Research Scope

Future research should focus on developing more sophisticated AI models tailored for metaverse environments, exploring novel approaches to privacy-preserving AI, and conducting longitudinal studies on the social and psychological impacts of AI interaction in immersive virtual spaces. Additionally, the development of standardized evaluation metrics for AI performance and ethics in the metaverse context will be crucial for ensuring accountability and facilitating continuous improvement. Therefore, by actively tackling these challenges and promoting responsible innovation, we can move closer to unlocking the transformative potential of AI in the metaverse, while minimizing risks and ensuring that this emerging field of human-computer interaction serves the greater good of society.

Conclusion

The integration of AI into the metaverse presents both exciting opportunities and significant challenges. This scoping review has identified key challenges in the areas of technical limitations, ethical concerns, data privacy and security, and governance. These challenges highlight the need for a multidisciplinary tactic to designing, regulating, and deploying AI technologies in virtual environments. Addressing the technical

limitations involves improving AI scalability, reliability, and adaptability within dynamic virtual environments. AI systems in the metaverse should be capable of real-time processing, decision-making, and personalization without compromising performance or accessibility. Researchers should prioritize the development of lightweight, decentralized AI architectures that can operate seamlessly across diverse platforms while ensuring interoperability between systems. Simultaneously, the ethical considerations surrounding AI applications in the metaverse entail urgent attention. Issues such as algorithmic bias, transparency, and accountability should be addressed to foster trust and fairness. Establishing clear ethical frameworks and standards for AI governance can help mitigate risks related to discrimination, misinformation, and exploitation in virtual spaces. Collaborative efforts among ethicists, policymakers, and technologists will be necessary to ensure AI operates in alignment with societal values and norms. Data privacy and security concerns also pose significant barriers to the responsible deployment of AI in the metaverse. With vast amounts of user data being collected, analyzed, and shared, vigorous security measures should be implemented to prevent breaches, unauthorized access, and misuse. Moreover, empowering users with greater control over their data and promoting transparency in data handling practices will be key to fostering user trust. The establishment of governance frameworks is another crucial area requiring intensive attention. Given the borderless nature of the metaverse, international cooperation will be essential in creating unified regulations and policies. Stakeholders, including governments, corporations, and non-profit organizations, must work together to define rules regarding AI accountability, intellectual property, and dispute resolution. Proactive governance mechanisms, including oversight bodies and compliance audits, can help address emerging risks while supporting innovation. So, the successful integration of AI into the metaverse will depend not only on technological breakthroughs but also on the ability of stakeholders to collaborate in addressing the diverse challenges outlined in this review. Researchers, developers, legislators, and industry leaders must engage in continuous dialogue to develop scalable solutions, ethical guidelines, and

regulatory structures. Such coordinated efforts will be critical to ensuring that AI technologies are harnessed responsibly, enhancing user experiences while safeguarding fundamental rights and freedoms. Finally, the metaverse has the potential to become a vibrant and inclusive digital ecosystem if its development is guided by foresight, responsibility, and ethical considerations. By embracing proactive governance, fostering innovation, and prioritizing user protection, we can unravel the full potential of AI in the metaverse. This collective slant will allow us to balance progress with accountability, enabling a future where AI-driven metaverse applications enrich society without compromising safety, equity, or privacy.

Abbreviation

Nil.

Acknowledgment

None.

Author Contributions

All authors contributed equally to this work and played key roles in drafting and revising the manuscript. Finally, all authors have accepted equal responsibility for the entire content of this manuscript and approved its final version.

Conflict of Interest

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

Ethics Approval

Not applicable.

Funding

This research is funded by the American Center of Science and Education (grant number: ACSE2024PG6).

References

- Buchholz F, Oppermann L, Prinz W. There's more than one metaverse. *i-com*. 2022 Dec 25;21(3):313-24.
- Ibrahim DM. A Tokenized Future: Regulatory Lessons from Crowdfunding and Standard Form Contracts. *Hastings LJ*. 2022; 74:45.
- Zhao M, Liu W, Saif ANM, Wang B, Rupa RA, Islam KA, Rahman SM, Hafiz N, Mostafa R, Rahman MA. Blockchain in online learning: A systematic review and bibliographic visualization. *Sustainability*. 2023 Jan 12; 15(2):1470.
- Lee LH, Braud T, Zhou PY, Wang L, Xu D, Lin Z, Kumar A, Bermejo C, Hui P. All one needs to know about metaverse: A complete survey on technological singularity, virtual ecosystem, and research agenda. *Foundations and trends® in human-computer interaction*. 2024 Nov 5; 18(2-3):100-337.
- Dionisio JD, Iii WG, Gilbert R. 3D virtual worlds and the metaverse: Current status and future possibilities. *ACM computing surveys (CSUR)*. 2013 Jul 3; 45(3):1-38.
- Yang Q, Zhao Y, Huang H, Xiong Z, Kang J, Zheng Z. Fusing blockchain and AI with metaverse: A survey. *IEEE Open Journal of the Computer Society*. 2022 Jul 4; 3:122-36.
- Risi S, Preuss M. From chess and atari to starcraft and beyond: How game ai is driving the world of ai. *KI-Künstliche Intelligenz*. 2020 Mar; 34(1):7-17.
- Pande S, Moon JS, Haque MF. Education in the era of artificial intelligence: evidence from Dhaka International University (DIU). *Bangladesh Journal of Multidisciplinary Scientific Research*. 2024 Feb 10;9(1):7-14.
- Maghool SA, Moeini SH, Arefazar Y. An educational application based on virtual reality technology for learning architectural details: challenges and benefits. *Archnet-IJAR: International Journal of Architectural Research*. 2018 Nov 1;12(3):246.
- Bonetti F, Warnaby G, Quinn L. Augmented reality and virtual reality in physical and online retailing: A review, synthesis and research agenda. *Augmented reality and virtual reality: Empowering human, place and business*. 2018:119-32. https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-319-64027-3_9.
- Falchuk B, Loeb S, Neff R. The social metaverse: Battle for privacy. *IEEE technology and society magazine*. 2018 Jun 4;37(2):52-61.
- Kugler L. Non-fungible tokens and the future of art. *Communications of the ACM*. 2021 Aug 24;64(9):19-20.
- Wang H, Ning H, Lin Y, Wang W, Dhelim S, Farha F, Ding J, Daneshmand M. A survey on the metaverse: The state-of-the-art, technologies, applications, and challenges. *IEEE Internet of Things Journal*. 2023 May 22;10(16):14671-88.
- Dwivedi YK, Hughes L, Baabdullah AM, Ribeiro-Navarrete S, Giannakis M, Al-Debei MM, Dennehy D, Metri B, Buhalis D, Cheung CM, Conboy K. Metaverse beyond the hype: Multidisciplinary perspectives on emerging challenges, opportunities, and agenda for research, practice and policy. *International journal of information management*. 2022 Oct 1;66:102542.
- Mystakidis S. Metaverse. *Encyclopedia*. 2022 Feb 10;2(1):486-97.
- Arksey H, O'Malley L. Scoping studies: towards a methodological framework. *International journal of social research methodology*. 2005 Feb 1;8(1):19-32.
- Saif ANM, Islam KA, Haque A, Akhter H, Rahman SM, Jafrin N, Rupa RA, Mostafa R. Blockchain Implementation Challenges in Developing Countries: An evidence-based systematic review and bibliometric analysis. *Technology Innovation Management Review*. 2022;12(1/2):1-7.
- Jafrin N, Saif ANM, Masud MM, Ghosh D, Nesa M. Nexus between demographic dividend and economic growth: A systematic review with

- bibliometric exploration. *Multidisciplinary Reviews*. 2024 Apr 20; 7(8):2024182-2024182.
19. Gong X, Yee CL, Lee SY, Cao EY, Saif ANM. Knowledge mapping of impulsive buying behavior research: a visual analysis using CiteSpace. *Humanities and Social Sciences Communications*. 2024 Jul 27; 11(1):1-18.
 20. Masud MM, Shamem AS, Saif ANM, Bari MF, Mostafa R. The role of artificial intelligence in sustainable water management in Asia: a systematic literature review with bibliographic network visualization. *International Journal of Energy and Water Resources*. 2024 Nov 26:1-19. <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s42108-024-00319-7>
 21. Sarker IH. Machine learning: Algorithms, real-world applications and research directions. *SN computer science*. 2021 May; 2(3):160.
 22. Azuma R, Baillet Y, Behringer R, Feiner S, Julier S, MacIntyre B. Recent advances in augmented reality. *IEEE computer graphics and applications*. 2001 Nov; 21(6):34-47.
 23. Noble SU. *Algorithms of Oppression: How Search Engines Reinforce Racism*. New York, USA: New York University Press; 2018. <https://doi.org/10.18574/nyu/9781479833641.001.0001>.
 24. Pasquale F. *The black box society: The secret algorithms that control money and information*. Harvard University Press; 2015. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctt13x0hch>.
 25. Floridi L, Cowls J. A unified framework of five principles for AI in society. *Machine learning and the city: Applications in architecture and urban design*. 2022 May 21:535-45. <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/9781119815075.ch45>
 26. Zuboff S. Surveillance capitalism or democracy? The death match of institutional orders and the politics of knowledge in our information civilization. *Organization Theory*. 2022 Nov; 3(3):26317877221129290. <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177/26317877221129290>
 27. Custers B, Sears AM, Dechesne F, Georgieva I, Tani T, Van der Hof S. *EU personal data protection in policy and practice*. The Hague, The Netherlands: TMC Asser Press; 2019 Mar 1. <https://link.springer.com/book/10.1007/978-94-6265-282-8>.
 28. Rahman SM, Saif ANM, Kabir S, Bari MF, Alom MM, Rayhan MJ, Zan F, Chu M, Talukder A. Blockchain in the banking industry: Unravelling thematic drivers and proposing a technological framework through systematic review with bibliographic network mapping. *IET Blockchain*. 2025; 5(1):1-20.
 29. Saif ANM, Rahman AA, Mostafa R. Post-implementation challenges of ERP adoption in apparel industry of developing country. *LogForum*. 2021; 17(4):519-29.
 30. Benabdallah A, Audras A, Coudert L, El Madhoun N, Badra M. Analysis of blockchain solutions for E-voting: a systematic literature review. *IEEE Access*. 2022 Jul 1; 10:70746-59.
 31. Binns R. Fairness in machine learning: Lessons from political philosophy. In *Conference on fairness, accountability and transparency 2018* Jan 21 (pp. 149-159). PMLR. <https://proceedings.mlr.press/v81/binns18a.html>
 32. Brundage M, Avin S, Wang J, Belfield H, Krueger G, Hadfield G, Khlaaf H, Yang J, Toner H, Fong R, Maharaj T. Toward trustworthy AI development: mechanisms for supporting verifiable claims. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2004.07213*. 2020 Apr 15. <https://arxiv.org/abs/2004.07213>.
 33. Alnoman A, Sharma SK, Ejaz W, Anpalagan A. Emerging edge computing technologies for distributed IoT systems. *IEEE Network*. 2019 May 15; 33(6):140-7.
 34. Jim JR, Hosain MT, Mridha MF, Kabir MM, Shin J. Towards trustworthy metaverse: Advancements and challenges. *IEEE Access*. 2023 Oct 20. <https://ieeexplore.ieee.org/document/10288438>.
 35. Wang X, Hong Y, He X. Exploring artificial intelligence generated content (AIGC) applications in the metaverse: Challenges, solutions, and future directions. *IET Blockchain*. 2024. <https://ietresearch.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1049/blc2.12076>.
 36. Soliman MM, Ahmed E, Darwish A, Hassanien AE. Artificial intelligence powered Metaverse: analysis, challenges and future perspectives. *Artificial Intelligence Review*. 2024 Feb 5; 57(2):36.
 37. Ali S, Abdullah, Armand TP, Athar A, Hussain A, Ali M, Yaseen M, Joo MI, Kim HC. Metaverse in healthcare integrated with explainable AI and blockchain: enabling immersiveness, ensuring trust, and providing patient data security. *Sensors*. 2023 Jan 4; 23(2):565.
 38. Rafique W, Qadir J. Internet of everything meets the metaverse: Bridging physical and virtual worlds with blockchain. *Computer Science Review*. 2024 Nov 1; 54:100678.
 39. Vargo SL, Fehrer JA, Wieland H, Nariswari A. The nature and fundamental elements of digital service innovation. *Journal of Service Management*. 2024 Mar 11; 35(2):227-52.
 40. Bibri SE, Allam Z. The Metaverse as a virtual form of data-driven smart cities: The ethics of the hyper-connectivity, datafication, algorithmization, and platformization of urban society. *Computational Urban Science*. 2022 Jul 28; 2(1):22.
 41. Gonaygunta H, Meduri SS, Podicheti S, Nadella GS. The Impact of Virtual Reality on Social Interaction and Relationship via Statistical Analysis. *International Journal of Machine Learning for Sustainable Development*. 2023 Jun 4; 5(2):1-20.
 42. Gadekallu TR, Wang W, Yenduri G, Ranaweera P, Pham QV, da Costa DB, Liyanage M. Blockchain for the metaverse: A review. *Future Generation Computer Systems*. 2023 Jun; 143:401-19.
 43. Njeru F. A Review of Artificial Intelligence and its Application in Business. *Journal of Enterprise and Business Intelligence*. 2023 Jan; 3(1):044-53.